# **EXHIBIT B**

# KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

AND AFFILIATED PARTNERSHIPS

200 East Randolph Drive Chicago, Illinois 60601

Serena J. Gondek
To Call Writer Directly:
312 861-2203
sgondek@kirkland.com

312 861-2000

www.kirkland.com

Facsimile: 312 861-2200 Dir. Fax: 312 861-2200

January 16, 2006

## VIA EMAIL

Michael J. Malecek Chief Advocacy Counsel Affymetrix, Inc. 6550 Vallejo Street, Suite 100 Emeryville, CA 94608

Re:

Affymetrix, Inc. v. Illumina, Inc. Civil Action No. 04-901 JJF

Dear Mike:

I write in response to Dan Reed's letter of December 20, 2005, regarding Illumina's redactions and privilege log.

Further to the discussion at the January 12<sup>th</sup> hearing, we have reviewed the documents that Mr. Reed identified in his December 20, 2005 letter to Marc Sernel (hereinafter "December 20 Letter"). I have provided below Illumina's positions regarding each document. We are also revising Illumina's Supplemental Privilege Log to reflect these positions and in a further attempt to anticipate entries you might ask us to clarify, despite the fact that Affymetrix has not identified any specific issues as to that log. We are working as diligently as possible to complete this revision, and will provide that as soon as possible, in any event, by the end of the day on Wednesday, January 18.

Our responses on a document by document basis to the issues Affymetrix raised in Mr. Reed's December 20 Letter are as follows.

# Redacted Documents Identified By Affymetrix As Not Appearing On Illumina's Privilege Log

As an initial matter, the following bates numbered documents were repeated twice in Affymetrix' listing of documents that did not appear on Illumina's Privilege Log: IAFP00586692; IAFP00599460; IAFP00599468; IAFP00599476; and IAFP00616024. Therefore, Illumina addresses Affymetrix' concerns with respect to the 89 documents (rather than the 94 documents) identified in its December 20 Letter.

London Los Angeles Munich New York San Francisco Washington, D.C.

Second, the following documents were neither contained on Illumina's Privilege Log or Supplemental Privilege Log nor could Illumina identify any redactions contained therein: IAFP004962791; IAFP00586015; IAFP00021008; and IAFP00020396.

Third, on January 11, 2006, Illumina produced a Supplemental Privilege Log addressing 68 of the 89 documents identified by Affymetrix. Further, in 13 instances, the documents Affymetrix identified were simply duplicates of documents already identified on the log.<sup>2</sup> However, for clarity, Illumina states its position on each document Affymetrix has identified in its December 20 Letter:

#### 1. Documents as to which Illumina maintains its redactions and for which Illumina will provide on its Revised Supplemental Privilege Log:

IAFP00517024;	IAFP00535712;	IAFP00547156;	IAFP00549028;
IAFP00570136;	IAFP00585331;	IAFP00585514;	IAFP00585824;
IAFP00586030;	IAFP00586254;	IAFP00587839;	IAFP00597806;
IAFP00614408:	IAFP00615999.		•

#### Documents contained on Illumina's Privilege Log or Supplemental Privilege Log 2. and as to which Illumina maintains its redactions:

IAFP00482171 (#25);	IAFP00503734 (#39);	IAFP00546406 (#1255);
IAFP00546441 (#1281);	IAFP00549030 (#947);	IAFP00550220 (#1241);
IAFP00550012 (#201);	IAFP00563823 (#1144);	IAFP00567162 (#56);
IAFP00567164 (#59);	IAFP00567264 (#61);	IAFP00570111 (#1239);
IAFP00585771 (#1064);	IAFP00585900 (#954);	IAFP00585954 (#1221);
IAFP00585935 (#1216);	IAFP00586037 (#1185);	IAFP00586162 (#977);
IAFP00586692 (#987);	IAFP00587841 (#993);	IAFP00590342 (#1098);
IAFP00590639 (#1028);	IAFP00591095 (#1030);	IAFP00595180 (#1179);
IAFP00603076 (#1206);	IAFP00603093 (#1207);	IAFP00605009 (#942);
IAFP00608005 (#832);	LAFP00605491 (#943);	IAFP00608034 (#924);
IAFP00608036 (#925);	IAFP00611631 (#1025);	IAFP00611688 (#1149);

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The "X"'s contained in the "From" line of the 3/17/05 email (IAFP 00496279) were not redacted and instead created, presumably, by the author of the email.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> IAFP00517024; IAFP00535712; IAFP00547156; IAFP00549028; IAFP00570136; IAFP00585331; IAFP00585514; IAFP00586030; IAFP00586254; IAFP00587839; IAFP00614408; IAFP00615999; IAFP00585824.

IAFP00613882 (#534); IAFP00616001 (#745); IAFP00616024 (#1393); IAFP00616939 (#827); IAFP00626328 (#30);

IAFP00597807 (redacted as non-responsive); IAFP00547162 (Dup. of #1122).

3. Illumina is withdrawing some of its prior redactions in the following documents but maintaining others. Illumina will address these in its Revised Supplemental Privilege Log:

```
IAFP00570451 (#1249); IAFP00582690; IAFP00590053 (#1297); IAFP00605011 (#1056); IAFP00608221 (#1238); IAFP00612610 (#1273); IAFP00612768 (#1252).
```

4. Illumina is willing to withdraw its redactions from the following documents and will provide unredacted copies promptly:

```
IAFP00587097 (#992):
                          IAFP00608028 (#923);
                                                    IAFP00607962 (#920);
IAFP00607932 (#831);
                          IAFP00606084 (#946);
                                                    IAFP00481686 (#20);
IAFP00570140 (#1121);
                          IAFP00612701 (#1244);
                                                   IAFP00612652 (#1288);
IAFP00612526 (#1307);
                          IAFP00607756 (#1163);
                                                   IAFP00608026 (#922);
IAFP00607967 (#921);
                          IAFP00612406 (#1285);
                                                   IAFP00603660 (#1055);
IAFP00603030 (#1181);
                          IAFP00603045 (#1215);
                                                   IAFP00603036 (#1214):
IAFP00599460 (#1203);
                          IAFP00599450 (#1202);
                                                   IAFP00599468 (#1204);
IAFP00599476 (#1205);
                         IAFP00482241 (#27);
                                                   IAFP00570830 (#836).
```

### Documents Identified As Inappropriately Designated and/or Redacted

We have reviewed the 21 documents identified in Affymetrix' December 20 letter as allegedly public documents inappropriately designated and/or redacted. We are continuing to investigate the redaction in IAFP00630885. As to the remaining documents identified, we will be producing unredacted copies shortly. We are continuing to investigate whether the confidentiality designation can be withdrawn from these documents. Given the Federal Holiday today, we are unable to complete these items today. We will, however, provide to you our position regarding these documents by Wednesday, January 18.

### Explanation of Privilege Regarding Certain Documents On Illumina's Privilege Log

Finally, Affymetrix has raised questions regarding a few log entries from Illumina's Privilege Log. In particular, Affymetrix questioned entries that lack an attorney as an author or an intended recipient. As is apparent from the documents logged by Affymetrix in its privilege log, you are aware that a document need not be authored or addressed to an attorney in order to

be withheld on attorney-client privilege grounds. Documents may, for example, be transmitted via non-attorneys in order to relay information requested or advice by counsel. However, Illumina provides the following explanations regarding Affymetrix' concerns:

- Log #11: The email reflects the transmission of legal advice by N. Espinosa regarding Affymetrix' complaint in this litigation.
- Log #12: The email reflects legal advice obtained from counsel (N. Espinosa) regarding Affymetrix' complaint in this litigation.
- Log #13: Duplicate of Log #12.
- Log #38: This document relates to a draft letter regarding the present litigation with requests for legal advice and comments of counsel (N. Espinosa).
- Log #114: This document reflects legal advice regarding intellectual property strategy.
- Log #116: Illumina will produce this document with redactions on January 18, 2006 and Illumina's Privilege Log will be revised accordingly. The redactions reflect legal advice (N. Espinosa) regarding intellectual property issues.
- Log #118: Duplicate of Log #116.
- Log #152: The email is authored by an Illumina employee assisting counsel (N. Espinosa) and seeking information for counsel so that counsel can provide legal assistance.
- Log #256: The email is authored by an Illumina employee assisting counsel (N. Espinosa) and seeking information regarding patent protection to provide to counsel so that counsel can provide legal assistance. This email also contains information reflecting legal advice from N. Espinosa.
- Log #277: This email thread is authored by Illumina employees and contains and reflects legal advice (N. Espinosa) regarding patent and patent licensing issues.
- Log #286: We will produce this document.
- Log #292: This email thread reflects legal advice (from N. Espinosa) provided to Illumina employees regarding certain technology coverage under a confidentiality agreement.
- Log #354: Duplicate of Log #11.

Log # 431: This document is authored by an Illumina employee working with counsel for the purpose of providing legal advice regarding patentability and patent prosecution.

Document 188-3

Illumina has also corrected Log Entry #39, which contains redacted bates numbered document IAFP00503734. This correction will be made in Illumina's Revised Supplemental Log.

As mentioned above, Illumina will provide to you as soon as possible, and no later than the end of the day January 18, a Revised Supplemental Log in an attempt to respond to all of the questions Affymetrix has brought to the attention of Illumina. Your attempt to impose a Monday deadline for this effort, which of course is a Federal Holiday, simply has no basis, although we have responded to all of the questions on which Affymetrix has purported to meet and confer.

Please do not hesitate to contact me should you have any questions.

Very truly yours,

Serena & Bondeh

Serena J. Gondek

cc: Daniel R. Reed

# **EXHIBIT** C

# EXHIBIT C

AFFYMETRIX EXAMPLE NO.	AFFYMETRIX' REASON FOR CITING DOCUMENT	ILLUMINA'S PRIVILEGE LOG ENTRY NO.	ILLUMINA'S RESPONSE
1	Redacted Documents without Identifiable Entries on Illumina's Privilege Log	35	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Entered on Illumina's Privilege Log which was served on Affymetrix October 24, 2005.
2	Redacted Documents without Identifiable Entries on Illumina's Privilege Log	39	Entered on Illumina's Privilege Log served on Affymetrix October 24, 2005 but bates number was incorrectly identified. Error addressed in Illumina's Response to Affymetrix dated January 16, 2006. Corrected in Revised Supplemental Log.
3	Redacted Documents without Identifiable Entries on Illumina's Privilege Log	201	Entered on Illumina's Privilege Log served on Affymetrix October 24, 2005 but bates number was incorrectly identified. Error addressed in Illumina's Response to Affymetrix dated January 16, 2006. Corrected in Revised Supplemental Log.
4	Redacted Documents without Identifiable Entries on Illumina's Privilege Log	201	Entered on Illumina's Privilege Log served on Affymetrix October 24, 2005 but bates number was incorrectly identified. Error addressed in Illumina's Response to Affymetrix dated January 16, 2006. Corrected in Revised Supplemental Log.
5	Redacted Documents without Identifiable Entries on Illumina's Privilege Log	201	Entered on Illumina's Privilege Log served on Affymetrix October 24, 2005 but bates number was incorrectly identified. Error addressed in Illumina's Response to Affymetrix dated January 16, 2006. Corrected in Revised Supplemental Log.
6	Insufficient Entry in Log to Identify	906	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.

7	Insufficient Entry in Log to Identify	1060, 1061	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
8	Insufficient Entry in Log to Identify	1162	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
9	Insufficient Entry in Log to Identify	1353	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
10	Insufficient Entry in Log to Identify	1355, 1357	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
11	Improper Redaction	1284	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
12	Improper Redaction	1263	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
13	Improper Redaction	1263	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
14	Improper Redaction	1017	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
15	Improper Redaction	1235	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
16	Improper Redaction	1235	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
17	Improper Redaction	1277	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.

10	T	1077	NT-4
18	Improper Redaction	1277	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
19	Improper Redaction	1277	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
20	Improper Redaction	1306	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redactions withdrawn.
21	Improper Redaction	1306	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction modified and addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
22	Improper Redaction	1306	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
23	Improper Redaction	877	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
24	Improper Redaction	1270	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
25	Improper Redaction	1420	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
26	Improper Redaction	1420	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
27	Improper Redaction	1420	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
28	Improper Redaction	1420	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.

29	Improper Redaction	1420	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
30	Improper Redaction	1420	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
31	Improper Redaction	1420	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
32	Improper Redaction	1251	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
33	Improper Redaction	1251	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
34	Improper Redaction	1251	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
35	Improper Redaction	1251	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
36	Improper Redaction	1251	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.

37	Improper Redaction	1251	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
38	Improper Redaction	1305	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Redaction withdrawn.
39	Improper Redaction	840	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.
40	Improper Redaction	1242	Not previously raised by Affymetrix. Addressed in Revised Supplemental Log.